Crossing Developmental Borders through Participation in HIV/AIDS-focused Service-Learning

Lucy A. LePeau  
University of Maryland, College Park

Susan Robb Jones  
The Ohio State University

Claire Kathleen Robbins  
University of Maryland, College Park

Monday, March 28, 2011  
ACPA Convention  
Baltimore, Maryland
Session Outline

- Video
- Presentation of studies and results
- Implications for service-learning and ASB practice
- Discussion and questions
Video
Pop Quiz: HIV/AIDS

In 2007, how many people were estimated to be living with HIV/AIDS globally? (UNAIDS, 2009)

a) 22,000,000
b) 33,000,000
c) 43,000,000
d) 53,000,000
Pop Quiz: HIV/AIDS

In 2007, how many people were estimated to be living with HIV/AIDS globally? (UNAIDS, 2009)

a) 22,000,000
b) 33,000,000
c) 43,000,000
d) 53,000,000
Pop Quiz: HIV/AIDS

In 2007, how many people were estimated to be living with HIV/AIDS in the United States? (UNAIDS, 2009)

a) 700,000
b) 1,200,000
c) 1,700,000
d) 2,200,000
Pop Quiz: HIV/AIDS

In 2007, how many people were estimated to be living with HIV/AIDS in the United States? (UNAIDS, 2009)

a) 700,000
b) 1,200,000
c) 1,700,000
d) 2,200,000
Pop Quiz: HIV/AIDS

In 2004, what percentage of new infections were estimated to be among youth ages 13-24? (Centers for Disease Control, 2004)

a) 3%
b) 8%
c) 13%
d) 18%
Pop Quiz: HIV/AIDS

In 2004, what percentage of new infections were estimated to be among youth ages 13-24? (Centers for Disease Control, 2004)

a) 3%
b) 8%
c) 13%
d) 18%
Pop Quiz: HIV/AIDS

In 2007, ___ of college students reported having had one or more sexual partners within the past 12 months, yet only ___ of those who were sexually active reported having used a condom the last time they had sex (American College Health Association [ACHA], 2007).

a) 33%, 22.2%
b) 44%, 33.3%
c) 55%, 44.3%
d) 66.3%, 55%
Pop Quiz: HIV/AIDS

In 2007, 66.3% of college students reported having had one or more sexual partners within the past 12 months, yet only 55% of those who were sexually active reported having used a condom the last time they had sex (American College Health Association [ACHA], 2007).

a) 33%, 22.2%
b) 44%, 33.3%
c) 55%, 44.3%
d) 66.3%, 55%
Pop Quiz: HIV/AIDS

What percentage of college students reported having ever received information about AIDS or HIV infection from their college or university? (ACHA, 2007)

a) 20.7%
b) 30.7%
c) 40.7%
d) 50.7%
Pop Quiz: HIV/AIDS

What percentage of college students reported having ever received information about AIDS or HIV infection from their college or university? (ACHA, 2007)

a) 20.7%
b) 30.7%
c) 40.7%
d) 50.7%
Process

- Engaged in a *constructivist* study of the meaning students made on one Alternative Spring Break (ASB) trip
- Lingering questions remained unanswered by the study
- Conducted a second study of the trip from a *critical* lens
Purpose of Each Study

1) To investigate students’ narratives about the meaning they made as they crossed physical and developmental borders on an ASB program focused on HIV/AIDS.

2) To explore the possibilities and limitations of service-learning by deconstructing the narratives about HIV/AIDS that emerged among college students who participated in an ASB program.
Two Sets of Research Questions

**Constructivist**
- What is to be learned about the nature of the experience through the stories told over time?
- What are the narratives associated with participants’ sense of self, relationships with others, and future plans?
- What difference did a trip focused on HIV/AIDS make to the narratives told?

**Critical**
- What structures of power and privilege surrounded and shaped students’ experiences around HIV/AIDS and the meaning they made of those experiences?
- What narratives, including silent or implicit narratives, emerged about HIV/AIDS?
- What do these narratives suggest about the possibilities and limitations of service-learning?
# Theoretical Approaches

## Constructivist
- Service-learning and short-term immersion programs
- Critical-developmental framework – “integrative” approach to service-learning (Jones, Gilbride-Brown, & Gasiorski, 2005, p. 21)
- Reflects a developmental understanding of students
- Also “acknowledges…the privileging conditions that situate students in service environments, …structures of inequality…, and the potential of service-learning as a critical pedagogy” (p. 21)

## Critical
- Foregrounded structures of power and privilege surrounding the context of HIV/AIDS
- Interrogated participants’ conceptualizations of HIV/AIDS; examined social justice implications
- Guided by a critical anti-foundational (Butin, 2010; Rhoads, 1997) approach to service-learning
- Anti-foundational approach disrupts the presumption of service-learning as transformational, interrogates taken-for-granted assumptions, and promotes “justice learning” (Butin, p. xviii)
Methodology (both studies)

- Theoretical borderlands advocated by Abes (2009)
- Analysis of narratives embedded within a single case of an ASB program (Chase, 2005; Clandinin & Connelly, 2000; Stake, 2005)
- Focus on HIV/AIDS, discrimination, and critical voices of student participants (critical read of the data)
Procedures (both studies)

Participants came from one site of a multi-site case study of ASB trips

Four data sources:
- Participant observation (during trip)
- Participant journal entries (during trip)
- First interview (shortly after trip)
- Second interview (one year later)
Data Analysis

Constructivist

- Each researcher independently read and coded each transcript and document
- Constant comparative analytic strategy (Charmaz, 2006)
- Focus on both the individual narratives and the shared context from which they emerged

Critical

- Each researcher independently read and coded each transcript and document
- Used focalization to shift vantage points between participants’ “internal and external points of view” (Holley & Colyar, 2009)
- Focus not only on stories that were told, but the “broader social discourses shaping that person’s story of their experience” (Clandinin & Rosiek, 2007, p. 55)
Introduction to Participants

- **Sasha** (Black woman, junior, public health major--“teaching people how to be self-sufficient”)
- **Aeriel** (White woman, junior, “so over English,” from a small town)
- **Lee** (White man, identifies as queer, junior, passion for “indirect service”--later led the trip)
- **Victoria** (White woman, sophomore, “wants to save the world”)
- **Laila** (Black woman from Kenya, “it’s the little things”--like time for others, economics major)
Findings – Constructivist Study

- Contextual Narrative
- Individual Narratives
- Shared Narratives
Contextual Narrative
Shared Narratives
Shared Narratives

• “It’s So Real”: The Power of Personal Interaction
Shared Narratives

• “Our Little Bubble”: Getting Out of One’s Element
Shared Narratives

• “I Want to Find Something”: Clarifying and Renewing Career Plans and Commitments
Shared Narratives

• Confronting the “Walls of Prejudice”: Encounters with Stigma and Discrimination
Findings – Critical Study

Students: “Modifying my Schema” about Living with HIV and Dying of AIDS

Health Center Residents: “You’re Lucky to Get to do Service”

Friends and Family: “She Would Cry if I Went to Africa”
Discussion

What is to be learned about the crossing of borders from this study?

Rethinking the triumphal narrative of service-learning

Decentering and remapping (Giroux, 1992)
Implications for Research

- Studying longer-term developmental outcomes
- Research focused directly on the experiences of underrepresented students
- What service-learning could be
Implications for Practice

- Developing educational programs and strategies to help students navigate the border crossing process
- Post-trip reflections
- Importance of the compelling context in which service takes place
- Opportunities for collaboration across functional areas around shared concerns: wellness, social justice…
Implications for Practice

How successful are service-learning and short-term immersion programs in realizing commonly stated goals: reciprocity, examination of root causes, commitments to social change?

Are short-term immersion programs situated from a charitable or social justice orientation? How might the orientation reinforce limitations or possibilities of service-learning?
Implications for Practice – Your Thoughts?
Your Questions and Suggestions?
Thank You!

Lucy A. LePeau
llepeau@umd.edu

Dr. Susan Robb Jones
jones.1302@osu.edu

Claire Kathleen Robbins
crobbins@umd.edu